**INTOSAI Working Group on Public Procurement Audit**

**Minutes of**

**the first meeting of Working Group**

**Lisbon, 4 July 2017**

**INTOSAI Working Group on Public Procurement Audit**

**Minutes of the 1st meeting**

4 July 2017

Chaired by N.A. Bocharova, the Executive Secretary of the Working Group on Public Procurement Audit (hereinafter – Working Group),

head of the Department of Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation

**Participants:**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Aram Mamikonyan | Chamber of Control of the Republic of Armenia | Head of Legal Department |
| Zorayr Karapetyan | Chamber of Control of the Republic of Armenia | Senior Specialist, Methodology and International Relations Department |
| Nadezhda Loput | Committee of State Control of the Republic of Belarus | Main Adviser |
| Xuanbo Zhang | National Audit Office of the People’s Republic of China | Deputy Director General |
| Xun Zhou | National Audit Office of the People’s Republic of China | International Cooperation |
| Muhsen Naser Al-Dousari | State Audit Bureau of Kuwait | Principle Auditor, Social and Service Affairs Audit Department |
| Munera Salem Al- Huwaidi | State Audit Bureau of Kuwait | Associate Auditor, Economic Affairs Pre-audit Department |
| Bader Osama Al-Khodher | State Audit Bureau of Kuwait | Asst. Auditor, Social and Service Affairs Audit Department |
| Ms. Agnese Brašmane | State Audit Office of Latvia | Senior State Auditor |
| Mr. Tafakhar Ali Asdi | Office of the Auditor General of Pakistan | Director General |
| Ms. Helena Abreu Lopes | Tribunal de Contas (Portugal) | Court member |
| Ms. Helena Santos | Tribunal de Contas (Portugal) | Auditor |
| Ms. Helena Leitão | Tribunal de Contas (Portugal) | Auditor |
| Asel Abdyldaeva\* | Accounts Chamber of the Kyrgyz Republic | Auditor |
| Ilimbek Isakov\* | Accounts Chamber of the Kyrgyz Republic | Analyst |
| Barchynay Toktosunova\* | Accounts Chamber of the Kyrgyz Republic | Expert |
| Natalya Bocharova | Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation | Head of Department |
| Eduard Mukhtarov | Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation | Head of inspection |
| Ekaterina Nikitina | Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation | Senior counselor |
| Andrey Abramov | The State Research Institute of System Analysis of the Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation | Deputy head of division |
| Radulka Urosevic | State Office Institution of the Republic of Serbia | Supreme State Auditor |
| Mirjana Markovic | State Office Institution of the Republic of Serbia | Secretary General |
| Iva Vasilic | State Office Institution of the Republic of Serbia | Head of the Office of the President |
| Mrs. Mojca Planinšek | Court of Audit of the Republic of Slovenia | Second Deputy President |
| Mr. Martin Brumec | Court of Audit of the Republic of Slovenia | Auditor |
| Khanamporn Philapurana | Office of the Auditor General of Thailand | Auditor |
| Sriprai Thongsin | Office of the Auditor General of Thailand | Directior of Provincial Audit Office (Chiang Rai) |

**\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_**

*\*via videoconference*

**MINUTES**

**Of the 1st meeting of INTOSAI Working Group**

**on Public Procurement Audit**

**1. Opening of the 1st meeting of the Working Group**

The opening remarks were made by Vítor Manuel da Silva Caldeira, Head of Portugal’s Supreme Audit Institution, and Natalia Bocharova, Executive Secretary of the INTOSAI Working Group on Public Procurement Audit and Head of Department of the Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation.

**2. Introduction of the participants of the Working Group meeting and approval of the agenda.**

*Speaker: Natalya Bocharova (Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation)*

It was noted that the INTOSAI Task Force on Procurement Contract Audit was re-named into the INTOSAI Working Group on Public Procurement Audit and new members – SAI Kuwait, SAI Pakistan, SAI Serbia and SAI Thailand have newly joined the group.

12 of 17 member SAIs took part at the meeting. They are SAI Russia, SAI Armenia, SAI Belarus, SAI China, SAI Kuwait, SAI Kyrgyzstan, SAI Latvia, SAI Pakistan, SAI Portugal, SAI Serbia, SAI Slovenia, and SAI Thailand.

Brief information has been given on the results achieved by the INTOSAI Task Force (including a short video, presented at INCOSAI in Abu Dhabi in December 2016).

The timeline for development, coordinating and approving of INTOSAI Standard for Public Procurement Audit as the Working Group’s main goal was announced.

The participants unanimously approved the meeting agenda and rules of procedure.

**3. New member SAIs presentations of the national reports on the experience in carrying out the Public Procurement Audit.**

*Speakers: SAI Kuwait, SAI Pakistan, SAI Serbia and SAI Thailand.*

The SAI officials emphasized the importance of the Working Group’s activities aimed at both making the public procurement audit procedures more effective and development the Standard. They also spoke about the national features of public procurement processes and their audit.

**4. Presentation of the Terms of Reference and the Working plan of the Group for 2017-2019**

*Speaker: Natalya Bocharova (Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation)*

Members of the Working Group approved Draft Terms of Reference and Work Plan for 2017-2019 presented at the meeting.

**5. Presentation of the Initial Assessment for INTOSAI Standard for Public Procurement Audit and on the drafting of the project proposal.**

*Speaker: Andrey Abramov (Russian Federation, The State Research Institute)*

Mr. Abramov presented an Initial Assessment of the draft Standard. Members of the Working Group were also briefed on the procedure and timelines of the Project Proposal for drafting the Standard.

**6. Presentation of the draft structure of INTOSAI Standard for Public Procurement Audit, discussion of the form for submitting proposals for the materials to be included in draft INTOSAI Standard for Public Procurement Audit**

*Speaker: Eduard Mukhtarov (Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation)*

Mr. Mukhtarov presented the draft structure of the INTOSAI Standard for Public Procurement and its basic principles, and proposed a form for submitting proposals for inclusion in the draft Standard. Members of the Working Group approved the draft structure of the Standard and the form of submitting the materials.

**7. Presentations of member SAIs**

*Speakers: SAI Armenia and SAI Portugal*

The SAI Armenia official spoke about the features of the public procurement process and its audit in the country.

The SAI Portugal official spoke about the current public procurement audit practices in the country, critical stages of the procurement process that require SAI attention, and the current project of the EU Contact Committee on updating the booklet on Public Procurement Audit.

**9. Summing up the meeting**

*Speaker: Natalya Bocharova (Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation)*

In the closing part of the meeting, all the participants noted the importance of the work to develop the Standard which should, among other things, take into account features of public procurement processes and their audit in different jurisdictions as well as SAI authority in this field.

Based on the approved Work Plan for 2017-2019, the meeting participants approved the format of interaction among the member SAIs to ensure its implementation.

**10. Closing of the meeting**

*Speaker: Natalya Bocharova (Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation)*

In her closing remarks Natalia Bocharova thanked all the participants for their active and fruitful work.

Special thanks were addressed to the Tribunal de Contas for the excellent organization of the meeting.

**The following decisions were made based on the results of the meeting:**

*1) Approve the Terms of Reference and plan of the Working Group for 2017-2019*

*2) Recognize the relevance and necessity of INTOSAI Standard for Public Procurement Audit development (the status of the document should be higher than the Guidance)*

*3) Member SAIs to submit to the Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation their proposals on the drafting of Project Proposal of for the Standard on for Public Procurement Audit.*

*Timing: July 20, 2017.*

*4) Approve the structure of the INTOSAI Standard for Public Procurement Audit and the form for submitting proposals for inclusion in the draft Standard.*

*5) Member SAIs to submit to the Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation their proposals on the contents of the Standard for Public Procurement Audit, according to the form of submitting enclosed.*

*Timing: September 30, 2017.*

*6) Member SAIs to continue its regular work to draft the Standard so that it could be approved at its next meeting.*

*7)  The Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation to hold consultations with the interested member SAIs on the venue of the 2nd meeting of the Working Group in 2018.*

*Annex: Format for submission of information to the draft Standard for Public Procurement Audit*

The Executive Secretary of the Working Group N.A.Bocharova