

DRAFT
**MINUTES OF THE 19th MEETING OF THE
INTOSAI WORKING GROUP ON IT AUDIT**
held in
Beijing, People's Republic of China (15-16 April, 2010)

The 19th meeting of the INTOSAI Working Group on IT Audit was held in Beijing, People's Republic of China from 15 to 16 April, 2010. The meeting was presided over by **Mr. Vinod Rai**, Comptroller & Auditor General of India and Chairman of the Working Group. The list of delegates who attended the meeting as members is attached as Annexure 1 and those who attended as observers are listed in Annexure 2.

1. Agenda item 1: Welcome Address

Mr. SHI Aizhong, Deputy Auditor General of the National Audit Office of the People's Republic of China welcomed **Mr. Vinod Rai**, the Chair of the INTOSAI Working Group on IT Audit and Comptroller & Auditor General of India, and all other delegates to the People's Republic of China. He thanked the members for giving them an opportunity to host the meeting in Beijing, China. He described the evolution of audit in China. He informed the members of his Government's interest in the implementation of IT audit especially in evaluating performances of IT projects. He wished the meeting all success in its deliberations and the members an enjoyable stay in Beijing.

2. Agenda item 2: Opening Remarks

Mr. Vinod Rai thanked **Mr. LIU Jiayi**, the Auditor General of the People's Republic of China, for the excellent arrangements made for the meeting. He welcomed the SAIs of Albania, Bangladesh, Brunei Darussalam, Cambodia, Congo, Cote d'Ivoire, Czech Republic, Iran, Iraq, Kenya, Morocco, Papua New Guinea, Serbia, Sri Lanka, Turkey and United Arab Emirates for joining the meeting as observers. He stated that the wide presence of delegates from non-member countries reflected the popularity and the growing importance of WGITA in the INTOSAI Community. He reminded the delegates that this being the last meeting before the XX INCOSAI in South Africa, the focus of the meeting would be to take stock of the developments and achievements of the Group for

reporting to the INCOSAI in November 2010. He stated that apart from reviewing the achievements for the current period, the members would also take up for discussion and approval the survey results on future projects for initiating the new Work Plan 2010-2013. He also apprised the members regarding the revised WGITA Mission Statement and templates developed for Work Plan/ Project Plan for consideration of the Working Group.

While elaborating on the extensive use of information technology by governments in decision making, he reminded members that IT applications in organizations were becoming increasingly complex. Against this backdrop the task of the Public Auditors had become extremely challenging in evaluating IT projects for achieving their stated objectives covering performance, cost and security parameters. To meet this challenge the Working Group was constantly endeavouring to support SAIs in developing their capacity and skills in the use and audit of Information Technology by facilitating knowledge sharing and encouraging bilateral and regional cooperation.

The Chair placed the Agenda of the meeting which was accepted without comments.

3. Agenda item 3: Inputs from the 6th Performance Auditing Seminar

SAI USA provided inputs from the Performance Auditing Seminar wherein 12 papers were presented covering the broad themes of the Seminar. The seminar was a great success as reflected by the participation of 82 delegates from 38 countries. Given the interest generated by the theme 'Performance Indicators', it was felt that the theme could continue for the next seminar. SAI USA however suggested that the Working Group could consider changing the format and frequency of the seminar for enabling detailed discussions and bilateral exchanges.

**4. Agenda item 4(a): Updates on: Into IT
4(b): Updates on: Working Group *website* &
Reference List of Material on Performance Audit**

SAI-UK provided an update on 'intoIT' and the website. It was decided that the future editions would be only available electronically. The 30th edition would focus on 'e-government audit' for which the deadline for sending contributions had been fixed as 31 May 2010. The Chair requested the members to send in their contributions for

adding topicality and variety as well as facilitating information interchange by sharing and highlighting good practices. The Working Group acknowledged the commendable job done by NAO, UK in managing the website and bringing out the journal.

5. Agenda item 5(a) and (b): Volunteers for Working Group *website* & intoIT

On the issue of volunteers for taking over the responsibility of editing the journal and hosting the website from SAI UK, it was decided on the suggestion of SAI Sweden that SAI-United Kingdom would send out a questionnaire highlighting the requirements of human as well as financial resources in consultation with the Chair. This would enable the members to give well thought out responses. SAI Australia also indicated its willingness to collaborate with NAO in hosting the website.

6. Agenda item 6: Reports on Ongoing Projects: (a) Database on IT Governance

In response to the issue raised by SAI South Africa regarding check list to act as a guide for auditing IT Governance, SAI Canada provided key questions as well as guidance on how to use the questions. It was noted that the project was successfully completed even though IT Governance remained a live issue and members were encouraged to expand and enhance the IT Governance database on the Working Group website.

7. Agenda item 6: Reports on Ongoing Projects: (b) Elaborate on E-Government Risks

SAI Norway provided an update on the risks associated with the life cycle of projects and also shared the main findings of the UN Survey (2008) on connected governance. As the aim of the project was to focus on specific questions and risks related to e-government, it was decided that SAI Norway would update the risks in its present structure.

8. Agenda item 6: Reports on Ongoing Projects: (c) IT Tools for Electronic Audit Papers

SAI Poland informed that the project could continue only if the members were interested in its new direction i.e. 'Architecture of SAI management system'. However, the primary role of data structure and processing and secondary importance of data entering software were made clearly visible.

9. Agenda item 6: Reports on Ongoing Projects: (d) Scoping paper on SAP in Public Administration and Fraud in IT Environment

SAI Netherlands proposed to discontinue both the projects. For the benefit of members, it was decided to host the results of the survey conducted by SAI Netherlands relating to availability and requirement of SAP expertise on the website.

10. Agenda item 7: IT Survey Results and Future Projects

SAI India presented the main findings of the survey and flagged the topics suggested by responding SAIs for discussion by the Working Group. After detailed deliberations, the following 5 projects were selected for the next triennial work plan.

- **Project 1: Development of IT Performance Indicators/Index System about IT Performance Audit/ Performance measurement of IT solutions implemented in government organizations**

Project Leader: SAI China

Project members: SAIs of Bhutan, Japan, Kuwait, Poland, Russia and USA

- **Project 2: IT Audit planning and detailed audit procedures to review IT controls**

Project Leader: SAI South Africa

Project members: SAIs of Bangladesh, Bhutan, Sri Lanka and Tunisia

- **Project 3: Optimising IT value in Government Organisations**

Project Leader: SAI Canada

Project members: SAIs of Brazil, Norway, Poland, Sweden and United Kingdom

- **Project 4: Green IT**

Project Leader: SAI Norway

Project members: SAIs of Austria, Canada, India and Sweden

- **Project 5: Cloud Computing and Virtualisation**

Project Leader: SAI United States of America

Project members: SAIs of Australia, Canada, India, Norway, Sweden, Turkey and United Arab Emirates

It was also decided that based on the template given by SAI Australia, the Project leads would present the business case for their projects, highlighting the approach, scope and deliverables of the proposed projects by the end of next month.

11. Agenda item 8: Review of WGITA Mission Statement and developing templates for future Work Plan/Project Plan

SAI India made a presentation on the Mission Statement, Charter and the Work Plan which had been developed with the active assistance of SAIs of USA, Canada, Sweden and Norway. These were adopted by the Working Group.

12. Agenda item 9: Country Paper Presentations:

- (a) IT Auditing in Bhutan
- (b) IT human Resource Development in SAI, Japan
- (c) Service delivery of IT in the department of the Auditor General of Pakistan
- (d) Evaluation Index for Performance Audit of IT Projects in China
- (e) ICT Governance Framework and Audit Issues in Kiribati
- (f) Approaches to Comprehensive Project and Program Audit in the Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation

There were six country paper presentations from SAIs of Bhutan, Japan, Pakistan, China, Kiribati and Russia.

SAI-Bhutan made a presentation on 'IT Auditing in Bhutan' highlighting their auditing framework and recent achievements in IT Audit.

SAI-Japan made a presentation on 'IT Human Resource Development in SAI Japan'. The presentation highlighted a unique model of capacity building wherein officers enhance their skills while doing their regular activities.

SAI-Pakistan made a presentation on 'Service Delivery of IT in the Department of the Auditor General of Pakistan'.

SAI-China presented a paper on 'Evaluation Index for Performance Audit of IT Projects'. This is also one of the topics for future Project of the Working Group.

SAI-Kiribati presented a paper on 'Information and Communications Technologies Governance Framework and Audit Issues in Kiribati'.

SAI-Russia made a presentation on 'Approaches to Comprehensive Project and Program Audit in the Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation'.

All the presentations were appreciated by the members.

13. Agenda item 10: Draft Report for XX INCOSAI 2010

The draft report, presented by SAI-India, highlighting the achievements and the future work plan of the Working Group to be presented in the next INCOSAI in South Africa was adopted by the Working Group.

14. Agenda item 11: Detailed Programme for the 20th meeting of the Working Group

SAI South Africa gave an update on the preparations for the next meeting proposed to be held in Sun City South Africa in April 2010. It was decided that SAI South Africa, after consultation with the Chair, would communicate the exact dates for the meeting later this year.

15. Agenda item 12: Discussion on the venue for the 21st Meeting of WGITA

SAI-Malaysia would be the host for the 21st meeting of the Working Group in 2012. The venue and the date for the meeting will be decided later. We thank SAI-Malaysia for so graciously agreeing to host the 21st meeting of the Working Group in 2012.

16. Agenda item 13: Any other item for discussion with the permission of the Chair

There was no other item for discussion.

17. Agenda item 14: Closing Remarks and Summing up

At the end, the Chairman, Mr. **Vinod Rai**, mentioned that these annual meetings of the INTOSAI Working Group on IT Audit were an important forum for collaboration on projects and exchange of information and ideas. He thanked **Mr. LIU Jiayi**, Auditor

General of the People's Republic of China and his officers for organizing and hosting this meeting, and expressed his gratitude to all members of the Group for their active participation and support to the proceedings.

The Chairman of the Working Group declared this meeting closed.

Members

Annexure ~1

#	Country	#	Name of Participant	Designation
1	Australia	1	Mr. Wayne Jones	Executive Director IT Audit
		2	Ms. Kristen Foster	Senior Director
2	Bhutan	3	Mr. Ugen Chewang	Auditor General
		4	Ms. Sonam Delma	ICT Officer
3	Brazil	5	Mr. Daniel Jezini Netto	Auditor
4	Canada	6	Mr. Richard Brisebois	Audit Principal
5	China	7	Mr. Shi Aizhong	Deputy Auditor General
		8	Mr. Zhou Weipei	Director General
		9	Mr. Wang Zhiyu	Director General
		10	Ms. Yang Li	Deputy Director
		11	Ms. Zhang Haiyan	Deputy Director
		12	Mr. Yi Ying	Auditor
6	Ecuador	13	Mr. Carlos Polit Faggioni	General Comptroller
		14	Ms. Pablo Celi De La Torre	Auditor
		15	Mr. Nelson Duenas López	Auditor
7	India	16	Mr. Vinod Rai	Comptroller and Auditor General of India
		17	Mr. Jagbans Singh	Principal Director-International Relations
		18	Mr. Alok Sinha	Principal Director & Secretary to CAG
		19	Mr. Amitabh Prasad	Director-International Relations
8	Japan	20	Ms. Tomohiro Shinozaki	Deputy Director
		21	Mr. Naoko Okawa	Auditor
		22	Ms. Takuji Matsumoto	Auditor
9	Kiribati	23	Mr. Lucas Paul Tatireta	Senior IT Auditor
10	Kuwait	24	Mr. Osama Alfari	IT Audit Supervisor
		25	Mr. Saad Alkhalfan	IS Auditor
11	Malaysia	26	Mr. Y Hamdan Haji Mohd Dom	Deputy Director of ICT
		27	Ms. Farida Veerankutty	Principal Assistant Audit Director
12	Netherlands	28	Mr. Thomas Wijsman	MA
		29	Mr. Matthijs Kerkvliet	MSc MPIM
13	Norway	30	Ms. Thor Kristian Svendsen	Director General
		31	Mr. Erna Joergensen Lea	Deputy Director General
14	Pakistan	32	Mr. Munawar Hussain	Auditor
15	Poland	33	Mr. Stanislaw Jarosz	Vice president
		34	Mr. Pawel Jan Banas	Advisor to the president
16	Qatar	35	Ms. Somaya Al-Shaabi	Head of Companies Control Section
		36	Mr. Abdulrahman Saud Aladbi	Senior Auditor
17	Russian	37	Mr. Nikolay Nekhoroshkin	Deputy Director of the department
		38	Mr. Alexander Myltse	Senior Inspector
18	Slovakia	39	Mr. Jan Beno	Auditor

#	Country	#	Name of Participant	Designation
19	South Africa	40	Mr.Kevin Moodley	Auditor
		41	Mr.Edward Pelcher	Auditor
20	Sweden	42	Mr.Bengt E W Andersson	Audit Director
		43	Mr.Bjorn Undall	Audit Director
21	United Kingdom	44	Mr.Angus Peter John Waugh	Head of IT
22	USA	45	Mr.Madhav Panwar	Sr. Level Technologist

Observers

Annexure – 2

#	Country	#	Name of Participant	Designation
1	Albania	1	Mr. Islam Mana	Director
		2	Mr. Osman Alushi	Director
		3	Mr. Athanas Karaja	Director
		4	Mr. Ded Trieshi	Director
		5	Ms. Evis Pustina	Director
		6	Ms. Deshira Huqi	Head of Sector
2	Bangladesh	7	Mr. Ahmed Ataul Hakeem	Comptroller & Auditor General
		8	Mr. Mohammed Iqbal Hossain	Senior Finance Controller (Defence Purchase)
3	Brunei Darussalam	9	Ms. Rostini Haji Jumat	Auditor
4	Cambodia	10	Mr. Chhorn Uth	Auditor General
		11	Mr. Nuppakun Chhay	Deputy Director
		12	Mr. Dara Hauv	Deputy Director
6	Cote d'Ivoire	13	Mr. Bogui Ziriyo	President
		14	Mr. SANON OUSMANE	Auditor
7	Czech Republic	15	Mr. Stefan Kabatek	Head of Division
		16	Mr. Jana Schenkova	Auditor
8	Iran	17	Mr. Abdol Reza Rahmani Fazli	Senior President
		18	Mr. Abdollah Safaee Nasab	Deputy Senior President
		19	Mr. Majid Zahedi Vash	Advisor to Senior President
		20	Mr. Saeid Rahati Quchani	Advisor to Senior President
		21	Mr. Morteza Asadi	Senior International Relations Expert
9	Iraq	22	Ms. Alaa Yasir hussein Hussein	Asst. Chief of Audit Team
		23	Ms. M.F.R. Al-Sammarraie	Asst. Chief of Audit Team
		24	Mr. Afaf Abbas Mahdi Mahdi	Senior Auditor
10	Kenya	25	Mr. Tom Gaya	Senior Auditor
		26	Mr. Leonard Chemuren	Senior Auditor
11	Morocco	27	Mr. Rachid Ismaili Alaoui	Magistrate
12	Papua New Guinea	28	Mr. George Sullimann	Auditor-General
13	Serbia	29	Mr. Radoslav Sretenovic	Auditor General, President of the SAI Council
		30	Ms. Iva Vasilic	Translator/Interpreter
14	Sri Lanka	31	Mr. Swarnajothy Sembakuttige	Auditor General
15	Tunisia	32	Mr. Zied Boumaiza	Magistrate, Deputy Concellor
16	Turkey	33	Mr. Ismail Cay	Principal Auditor
		34	Mr. Necip Polat	Senior Auditor
17	United Arab Emirates	35	Mr. Yaser Fadil	Senior IT Auditor
		36	Mr. Abdulla Alshehhi	IS Auditor
		37	Mr. Mohammed Almarzouqi	IS Auditor
		38	Mr. Tariq Al Hajeri	Assistant Auditor